

# СОЦИАЛЬНАЯ ДЕМОГРАФИЯ



DOI [10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5](https://doi.org/10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5)  
EDN [BMXWQT](#)

## DISCRIMINATION AGAINST MIGRANTS IN THE MOSCOW RENTAL MARKET (CASE STUDY OF IRANIAN AND TAJIK STUDENTS)

**Mehdi Afzali**

*Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia*  
E-mail: [mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com](mailto:mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com)

**Zafar K. Vazirov**

*Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia*  
E-mail: [zafar.vazirov@mail.ru](mailto:zafar.vazirov@mail.ru)

**Natal'ya A. Bezverbnaya**

*Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia*  
E-mail: [n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru](mailto:n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru)

**For citation:** Afzali, Mehdi. Discrimination against Migrants in the Moscow Rental Market (Case Study of Iranian and Tajik Students) / M. Afzali, Z. K. Vazirov, N. A. Bezverbnaya. *DEMIS. Demographic Research*. 2023. Vol. 3, No. 1. P. 69–82. DOI [10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5](https://doi.org/10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5). EDN [BMXWQT](#).

**Abstract.** For finding accommodation in Moscow, international students face many discriminatory advertisements and landlords who refuse to lend their properties to immigrants because of their ethnicities, religion, etc., which puts tremendous pressure on international students. However, the landlords might believe that their behavior is not discriminating. Therefore, in this study, we aim to investigate the existence of discrimination against Iranian and Tajik students in Moscow's rental market. We have chosen Iranian and Tajik students currently studying in Moscow since the students from these two countries share a similar language, religion, and culture. This study uses a qualitative approach based on a structured interview consisting of 15 questions to understand the problems Iranian and Tajik students face in Moscow's rental market. Also, we analyzed 1,221 rental advertisements to determine the number of discriminatory expressions on Russian real estate websites and applications. The results show that discriminative words such as "Strictly Slav," "Only Slav," and "Slav (Russian citizens only)" include almost 25% of the advertisements on internet websites. The study results also show that landlords refuse to lend an apartment, room, or bed to Iranian and Tajik students for almost the same reasons, such as their ethnicities, religion, and a citizen of another country rather than the Russian federation being a student. We can conclude that the role of universities in facilitating the housing problems of international students and the role of the government in providing juridical access in terms of discrimination is essential.

**Keywords:** discrimination; xenophobia; international students; immigration; immigrants; real estate; interview; housing market; Moscow.

### Introduction

Integration success is defined essentially as a function of two key variables or processes: the immigrant's acculturation model and their effectiveness in coping with the challenges faced in the host country [1]. According to the scientists, factors such as language

barriers, racial discrimination, financial problems, psychological and cultural diversity, poor social support, and daily life tasks significantly impact the acculturation process [2]. Especially for international students, many of these factors can appear at the beginning of their immigration process. Moreover, a study has explained that acculturative stress corresponds with significant anxiety and symptoms of depression in international students [3]. Acculturative stress is a multidimensional phenomenon including physical, psychological, financial, spiritual, social, and language dimensions.

Providing accommodation for many members of a population can be problematic, still, this obstacle may be more difficult for immigrants due to language barriers and cultural differences. Many people use the internet as the fastest and easiest way to find any living place for rent, such as apartment, house, room, or even a bed. Especially international students with a low level of the Russian language using translator applications can read ads and find a place for rent. The rental apartment market is enormous in all countries, and many applications and websites serve this market, Russian Federation is also no exception. Immigrants and international students also have the same accessibility to the internet and websites; but we can see many ethnics discriminated advertisements in the Moscow rental market, which is very disappointing for international students to face discrimination and xenophobia in the host country, that eventually causes vast social complications and affects their integration process.

Typically, the university should provide suitable places for all international students according to their marital status and budgets. At first glance, it may seem that students should not have a particular problem due to the providing dormitory. But some universities in Russian Federation cannot offer enough dormitories even for Russian students. Therefore, in this study, we aim to investigate the existence of discrimination against Iranian and Tajik students in the Moscow rental market. We have chosen Iranian and Tajik students currently studying in Moscow since the students from these two countries share a similar language (Farsi or Persian), religion (Islam), and culture. In the 2018/2019 academic year, 17,241 students from Tajikistan and 3,433 from Iran were studying in Russian universities, respectively, 4.8% and 0.9% of the total international students (355,4 thousand). Around 39% (6,736 students) of the Tajik and 93% (3,198 students) of the Iranian students pay for their tuition fees (based on contracts)<sup>1</sup>.

### Literature review

The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization defines Xenophobia as “*an attitudinal orientation of hostility against non-natives in a given population*” (UNESCO)<sup>2</sup>. Xenophobia can lead to the civic exclusion of the foreigners as community-part from the host country, based on their culture or national citizenship [4]. Xenophobia in Russia has historical roots. The Soviet Union followed a complex and contentious ethnic policy, including combining anti-discriminatory and discriminatory interventions, such as the intense anti-racism propaganda, the control of the people mobility (restrictions on mobility, or, on the opposite, waves of forced migration), and promotion of local languages and cultures [5]. Determining xenophobia as a form of racism signifies that a fight against

<sup>1</sup> Export of Russian Educational Services: Statistical Collection. Issue 10 / Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation. Moscow : Pushkin State Russian Language Institute, 2020. 557 p.

<sup>2</sup> Xenophobia. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization // Internet Archive : [site]. URL: <https://wayback.archive-it.org/10611/20171126022534/http://www.unesco.org/new/en/social-and-human-sciences/themes/international-migration/glossary/xenophobia/> (accessed on 01.02. 2023).

xenophobia is a fight against racism [6]. While a paper proved mixed evidence for claims that xenophobia has been on the rise in Russia [7].

One of the problems arising from the migration process is xenophobia and its various forms, which lead, among other things, to discrimination in social interactions. Xenophobia is characteristic of significant number of people, especially for immigrant host of the world; Russia is no exception. Labor migrants, refugees, people affected by military conflicts, natural disasters, climate change, and immigrants involved in educational migration are subject to various forms of intolerance. Therefore, the concept of xenophobia occupies an essential place in sociologists' and jurists' research because the stated problem is characterized by many debatable issues and unsystematic theoretical and factual material.

The study of the problem of xenophobia can be carried out from different theoretical and methodological positions. One of the approaches is the doctrine of nationalism, which sets the framework of what should be understood by a nation; how its borders and political independence are determined; what are the criteria for "inclusion" in the nation and "exclusion" from it. As V. I. Ilyushenko notes, nationalism is always based on a very archaic socio-psychological structure: a sharp distinction between 'our' and 'strangers,' between 'we' and 'they' [8; 9].

Ethnophobia is one of the structural components of xenophobia. Such foreign authors as E. Balibar and I. Wallerstein, R. Brubaker, G. Garfinkel, K. Murji and D. Solomos, R. Park studied the relationship between ethnic and social in a broader context.

R. Brubaker considers migrant phobia both xenophobia and a component of one of the specific forms of nationalism, which he calls protective, protectionist, and nationally populist. In his opinion, this type of nationalism is not focused on building sovereign statehood. However, it seeks to protect the national economy, language, and culture from the alleged (and therefore, let us add, mythical) threat from the outside [10].

The socio-psychological emphasis in the xenophobic study attitudes, the nature of the formation of prejudices and stereotypes, and the conditions necessary for managing negative perception are presented in the G. Allport works, in the studies of T. Pettigrew and L. Tropp devoted to the "theory of contact" [11].

Discrimination is the main obstacle to the full integration of migrants into the labor market and society; its actual prevalence is difficult to assess. Discrimination as a subject of economic research on social and labor relations dates back to the famous work of G. Becker, "The Economics of discrimination" (1957). During this time, Western scientific thought has seriously advanced along the path of studying its economic causes and consequences (G. Becker, K. Boulding, F. Jones, P. Doring, L. Kach, M. Pior, M. Spence, etc.), individual species (S. Levitt, J. Milkovich, N. Richebe, J. Roland, S. Smith, P. Henderson, B. Hepple, B. Schmitt, N. Schneider, etc.), the situation of specific social groups subject to discrimination (B. Bergman, M. Bertrand, F. Blau, D. Weitvogel, L. Witt, F. Woolley, K. Goldin, R. Johnson, L. Kach, A. Sen, P. Sloan, et al.), evaluation tools (P. Anker, A. Blinder, S. Jenkins, O. Duncan, J. Mintzer, D. Newmark, R. Oaxaca, S. Hakim, J. Heckman, etc.), analysis of formal anti-discrimination norms (D. Goldston, G. Dessler, X. Jones, N. Jewson, R. Kramar, E. Linton, M. Min, X. Moser, D. Mason, A. O'Reilly, J. Stradwick, P. Torrington, R. Shaffer, etc.) [12].

Discrimination produces other forms of violation of human rights and inequality in society, for this reason, discrimination of migrants in the socio-economic sphere can be considered the main obstacle of the host community on the path of socio-economic adaptation and integration of migrants.

The Russian Federation government always tries to decrease discrimination against immigrants, and the Russian law ensures protection against discrimination. For this purpose, the Russian government banned discriminatory job advertisements in 2013. Still, Russia is one of the countries with general common xenophobia, and Moscow rental market is one of the places where international students can directly face ethnic discrimination. Because it is supposed that nobody should specify landlords how they want to handle their private properties, there are no such restrictions on the rental apartments market. Therefore, there are meager chances to win a lawsuit against ethnic-based discrimination in rental promotions [13]. Moreover, it also exists overt discrimination which is often considered as a pure manifestation of racial hatred. At the same time, the evidence indicates that overt discrimination observed in the rental market in Moscow has a lot in common with typical subtle discrimination, where the landlords believe their behavior is not discriminating [14]. For example, in European countries, including the Russian Federation, still, most correspondence studies result often noted that minorities of European origin were treated preferentially compared with minorities of non-European origin [15–18].

A part of internet advertisements in the Moscow rental market also includes specific nationality-based limitations. “No Caucasians,” “No Asians” are popular, but the most obvious is “Slavs only”. These misperceptions are extensive among almost poor and low-educated landlords. Language barrier at the first raw of all immigrant’s life aspects can make many difficulties which renting a suitable place may be one of them. Although a high level of language knowledge is necessary for immigration, discrimination can even happen by accent differentiation. Given information, though foreigners include these discriminations, even Russian citizens from other areas such as Caucasia or the Asian part of the Russian Federation face that discrimination which is the significant sign of the discrimination depth in the Moscow rental market [19].

On the one hand, discrimination in the rental market affects the integration process of the immigrants. Although a considerable number of internal and external immigrants settle in metropolitan cities such as Moscow, the differences in language, culture, citizenship, and even race can lead to discrimination. Nevertheless, discrimination affects the acculturation model of international students. By arriving at the host country even if they know the host country’s language, international students still have not adapted to its culture. Therefore, the integration processes of the international students will be complicated, and it will be challenging to attract educated immigrants to the host country in the future, because of their negative social experiences.

After all, some rules provide spaces for discrimination. The constant enactment of often restrictive new laws makes confusion in the management and pushes migrants continuously into an immethodical situation. Some Russian officials perceive migration control, and migrants themselves consider this confusion as a source of income that paves the way for profiteers and the spread of a culture of bribery. Given information, the official registration of Russian citizens and immigrants rule’s confusion is one of the difficulties in the process of immigration [20].

As registration cards are essential for every immigrant, and international students are not exceptions. Providing a registration card is one of the most severe obstacles for all international students, especially when universities are not responsible for it, and they cannot offer a dormitory. Citizens’ official registration is one of the Russian Federation rules that include all Russians and foreigners, but it has some differences in duration and requirement. Indeed, citizens’ official registration rule has changed many times during several

years in the Russian Federation. Residence registration or 'propiska' started to regularize internal migration fully by controlling the immigrants in the former Soviet Union [21]. Given all, registration card is one aspect of possible discrimination for students as educational immigrants. Still, another part of discrimination exists in the rental market, which is not just about immigrant students but Russian residents. Deep xenophobia and social discrimination need lots of works and researches for rooting and problem solving to reduce social confusion. As one of the immigrant countries, Russia can attract immigrants according to its needs, especially educated immigrants. However, the Russian Federation government needs to review and change some immigration rules according to their complexity. The rules can change according to the needs and benefits of society and country. In between using modern technologies to solve and reduce problems according to the country's infrastructures might be beneficial.

### Methodology

This research uses a qualitative approach. The authors used a structured interview method; an interview protocol consists of 15 questions in two sections (length of interview, 30–43 minutes). The first section includes demographic questions, and the second section consists of questions aiming to understand the problems Iranian and Tajik students face in the Moscow's rental market. This method is helpful to understand the specific experience of respondents to a topic that a researcher investigates. The answers are collected and narrowed down to find the main factors affecting the Integration of Iranian and Tajik Students to the Rental Market of Moscow from a discriminatory perspective. Then the authors compared the results of similarities and differences for Iranian and Tajik students studying in Moscow. To ensure the validity and reliability of the results, the final answers were shown to the respondents to confirm the answers. The interviews were conducted online in zoom and face to face in Persian and Russian languages.

Table 1

**Characteristics of the Iranian and Tajik students interviewed  
(number and share of respondents)**

Respondents	Iranian students	Tajik Students	Total
Male	8 (57%)	9 (69%)	17 (63%)
Female	6 (43%)	4 (31%)	10 (37%)
Less than 20 years old	0	4 (31%)	4 (15%)
21–25 years old	10 (71%)	3 (23%)	13 (48%)
26–30 years old	2 (14%)	4 (31%)	6 (22%)
31–35 years old	2 (14%)	2 (15%)	4 (15%)
Single	9 (64%)	6 (46%)	15 (56%)
Married	1 (7%)	5 (38%)	6 (22%)
In a relationship	4 (29%)	2 (16%)	6 (22%)
Less than 1 year (duration of stay in Moscow)	4 (29%)	4 (31%)	8 (30%)
15 years (duration of stay in Moscow)	9 (64%)	7 (54%)	16 (59%)
More than 5 years (duration of stay in Moscow)	1 (7%)	2 (15%)	3 (11%)
University hostels	1 (7%)	3 (23%)	4 (15%)
Private hostels	9 (64%)	4 (31%)	13 (48%)

Respondents	Iranian students	Tajik Students	Total
Apartment	3 (21%)	5 (38%)	8 (30%)
House	1 (7%)	1 (8%)	2 (7%)
Number of respondents	14	13	27

*Source:* compiled by the authors

Moreover, authors in this study randomly chose 1,221 rent advertisements in Russian real estate websites and applications such as Yandex (563 ads), Avito (343 ads), and Cian (315 ads) to find any written words, sentences, or other expressions that show discrimination, racism, etc. In the end 518 apartments, 562 rooms, and 141 beds advertisements were analyzed. The price range is 5,000 rubles to 100,000 rubles in nine geographical locations of Moscow (North, Northeast, Northwest, South, Southeast, Southwest, East, West, and Center). Moreover, the authors randomly approached 42 ads to find out if they will further face any rejection (because of their race, their immigration status, etc.) in the process of renting a place of living by the landlords who posted the ads.

### **Review and discussion of rent advertisements in Moscow**

Today, anti-discrimination laws are in priority in many countries, and they are widespread. Countries are measured based on their activities against discrimination. One of the methods to find out the countries' success in terms of anti-discrimination policies for immigrants is to use the Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX). Based on this index, over the last five years, anti-discrimination policies in Europe improved by 2 points. Although Russia's MIPEX score from 2014 to 2019 has been enhanced by 2 points (31 points/100-point MIPEX scale in 2019), it is critically lagging behind the international trends in anti-discrimination policies for immigrants. Russia's situation in terms of anti-discrimination in 2020 is slightly unfavorable (22 points/100-point MIPEX scale in 2019). It ranks below Moldova, Ukraine, Turkey, or the average EU or Central European countries. Russia ranks 6<sup>th</sup> from the bottom and slightly more advanced than Jordan, Indonesia, and India, and the immigrants who face discrimination are unlikely to access justice in Russia<sup>3</sup>.

The results of the rent advertisements analysis show that out of 1,221 ads randomly chosen, only one ad (0.08%) includes the "Nationality does not matter." 12 (0.98%) ads contain "Slav (Russian, Belarus, Ukraine)," 29 (2.38%) ads "Slav (Russian citizens)," 193 (15.81%) ads "only Slavs" and 98 (8.03%) ads contain "Strictly Slavs." Almost 27% of the ads (332 ads) include specific discriminative words such as Only Slav, Strictly Slav, or citizens of a particular country, etc., that deliberately or unintentionally reflects the discriminatory behavior of the Russian landlords. However, they might believe their behavior is not discriminating. Since Russia has prohibited discriminatory advertisements, 832 (68.14%) contain nothing specific to show a discriminative attitude. 56 (4.59%) of the ads contain "Citizen of Russian Federation only," which authors consider in this article a moderate approach towards immigrants who want to rent a place.

<sup>3</sup> Russia // Migrant Integration Policy Index 2020 : [site]. URL: <https://www.mipex.eu/russia> (accessed on 01.02.2023).



Table 2

**Price of the rent in the chosen advertisements and discrimination level of the ads**

	Discrimination level	0–19,999 rubles	20,000–39,999 rubles	40,000–59,999 rubles	60,000–79,999 rubles	80,000–100,000 rubles	Total
Least discriminatory expressions	1. Nationality does not matter	1 (0.08%)	-	-	-	-	1 (0.08%)
	2. Nothing mentioned	319 (26.13%)	267 (21.87%)	150 (12.29%)	62 (5.08%)	34 (2.78%)	832 (68.14%)
	3. Citizens of Russian Federation only	27 (2.21%)	21 (1.72%)	6 (0.49%)	2 (0.16%)	-	56 (4.59%)
	4. Slav (Russian, Belarus, Ukraine)	5 (0.41%)	6 (0.49%)	1 (0.08%)	-	-	12 (0.98%)
	5. Slav (Russian citizens)	10 (0.82%)	11 (0.90%)	6 (0.49%)	1 (0.08%)	1 (0.08%)	29 (2.38%)
	6. Only Slav	101 (8.27%)	61 (5%)	29 (2.38%)	2 (0.16%)	-	193 (15.81%)
Most discriminatory expressions	7. Strictly Slav	37 (3.03%)	31 (2.54%)	19 (1.56%)	10 (0.82%)	1 (0.08%)	98 (8.03%)
	Total	500 (40.95%)	397 (32.51%)	211 (17.28%)	77 (6.31%)	36 (2.95%)	1,221 (100%)

Source: compiled by the authors

In addition, the authors randomly approached 42 advertisements (5%) out of 832 advertisements that contained no discriminative expression to determine if the landlords would refuse to lend them (as international students) a place to live. Out of 42 landlords approached, 17 landlords (40%) agreed to show the apartment to international students from Iran and Tajikistan. In addition, 3 (7%) landlords hung up the phone on the authors after mentioning their nationality, and 22 landlords (53%) preferred to lend the apartment, room, or bed to Russian citizens or Slavs. In the following correlation analysis, Although the following correlation analysis shows that the correlation coefficient is significant (sig. 0.0022) between the price and ads discrimination level, there is no strong negative linear relationship between the variables ( $r = -0.0874$ ).

Table 3

**Pairwise correlation analysis between price and advertisements' level of discrimination (sig. level = 0.05)**

	Price	Ads discrimination level
Price	1.0000 1,221	
Ads discrimination level	Corr. Coeff. = -0.0874 Sig. = 0.0022 1,221	1.0000 1,221

Source: compiled by the authors in Stata program version BE/17

We cannot rely on the fact that if the prices of the rents go up, the discrimination level of the ads linearly will surely go down. However, it is possible to predict the relationship between the rent price fluctuation and ads discrimination level for given prices. Table 4 shows that for the first three categories of rent prices (0–19,999 rubles, 20,000–39,999 rubles, and 40,000–59,999 rubles), there is the most prominent ads discrimination level margin given 3.31, 3.17, and 3.12 respectively, and accordingly with the highest t value given 39.91, 34.07 and 24.46.

Table 4

**Adjusted predictions Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) method between the price category and advertisements' level of discrimination**

Number of observations 1,221 advertisements	Margin	Std. err.	t	P >  t	(95% conf. interval)	
0–19,999 Rubles	3.31	0.0829332	39.91	0.000	3.147292	3.472708
20,000–39,999 Rubles	3.171285	0.0930718	34.07	0.000	2.988685	3.353884
40,000–59,999 Rubles	3.123223	0.1276651	24.46	0.000	2.872754	3.373691
60,000–79,999 Rubles	2.818282	0.2113334	13.34	0.000	2.403563	3.2328
80,000–100,000 Rubles	2.222222	0.3090739	7.19	0.000	1.615845	2.828599

Source: compiled by the authors in Stata program version BE/17

As the rent prices go beyond 80,000 rubles, with 95% confidence, we may predict that the landlords will either do not care about the nationality of the potential tenants or mention nothing discriminative in their ads. And a small number of landlords will prefer to lend their properties to the citizens of the Russian Federation only.



**Fig. 1. Linear prediction model between the price category and level of discrimination in advertisements**

Source: compiled by the authors in Stata program version BE/17

While as the prices of the rents decrease to less than 40,000 rubles, the number of ads containing discriminative expressions will increase. The ads will include more expressions



as Citizens of the Russian Federation only, Slav (Russian, Belarus, Ukraine), and Slav (Russian citizens). This discriminative attitude affects the international immigrants, specifically international students, and affects the renting process of the other Russian ethnicities such as Caucasians. Therefore, the international students and especially the students who are unable to speak Russian, will suffer the most in the rental market of Moscow.

### Results of the interview

The interviews' results show that 57% of the Iranian students have faced discrimination in Russia. In comparison, only 31% of the Tajik students experienced discrimination from the Russian landlords. This is probably because of the higher level of familiarity of Tajik students with Moscow's rental market, in terms of language, the process of renting, a greater number of acquaintances, etc., than Iranian students who barely speak the Russian language. In total, 44% of our interviewees faced discrimination, and 56% did not face discrimination from the Russian landlords. The results show that the more the respondents use agents and friends to find an apartment, room, or bed, the less they face discrimination. Iranian students mostly use agents (50%) to find a place of living, almost 35% used internet websites, and 14% found the place of living by friends. Most of the Tajik students find a place to live through their friends and families (54%), around 38% through the websites (Cian and Avito), and 8% use services provided by the agents to find a place to live.

However, the results cannot confirm a relationship between the price of the rent and the level of discrimination. Around 79% of the Iranian students pay more than 20,000 rubles rent, and they are mainly living one or two students in the apartment. Overall, 93% of the Iranians pay more than 15,000 thousand rubles rent per month. On the other hand, Tajik students usually pay much less rent than Iranians. Almost 77% of the respondents pay less than 15,000 rubles rent every month, and there are usually more than three students in one apartment, on average four students in one flat (35 square meters).

Answering the question of what kind of discrimination Iranian students faced by the landlords (Main reasons why landlords rejected to lend their apartment to them), the following words were shown the most in the interviews: 1) because of the Iranian nationality; 2) not a Russian citizen; 3) religion; 4) being a student; and 5) bad language tone (intonation) which is possible since the Iranian students barely speak Russian, and they might get confused about the words and the language tone – answering the same question, most of the Tajik students were rejected to rent a place because of: 1) their nationality; 2) religion; and 3) citizenship.

Table 5

### Brief answers retrieved from the interviews with Iranian and Tajik students (number and share of respondents)

Respondents	Iranian students	Tajik Students	Total
Faced discrimination	8 (57%)	4 (31%)	12 (44%)
Did not face discrimination	6 (43%)	9 (69%)	15 (56%)
Have problem with registration cards	12 (86%)	3 (23%)	15 (56%)
Did not have problem with registration cards	2 (14%)	10 (77%)	12 (44%)
Pay for the registration card	9 (64%)	2 (15%)	11 (41%)
Did not pay for the registration card	5 (36%)	11(85%)	16 (59%)
<i>How much rent do you pay?</i>			
less than 5000 rubles	0	3 (23%)	3 (11%)
5,000–10,000 rubles ( <i>Rent</i> )	0	5 (39%)	5 (19%)

Respondents	Iranian students	Tajik Students	Total
10,000–15,000 rubles ( <i>Rent</i> )	1 (7%)	2 (15%)	3 (11%)
15,000–20,000 rubles ( <i>Rent</i> )	2 (14%)	2 (15%)	4 (15%)
More than 20,000 rubles ( <i>Rent</i> )	11 (79%)	1(8%)	12 (44%)
<i>Where did you find the place of living</i>			
Cian	3 (21%)	1(8%)	4 (15%)
Avito	2 (14%)	4 (30%)	6 (22%)
Friends and families	2 (14%)	7 (54%)	9 (33%)
Agents	7 (50%)	1 (8%)	8 (30%)
Number of respondents	14	13	27

*Source:* compiled by the authors

One of the main struggles of immigrants and international students in Russia who reside in university hostels, private hostels, apartments, rooms, etc., should have a registration card. However, receiving registration cards for those students who are not living in university hostels or private hostels is a struggling task. Many landlords do not register their tenants or ask for an additional monthly sum of money to register their tenants. The interview results show that Iranian students suffer much more than Tajik students in terms of registration cards. Almost 86% of Iranian students have had problems with their registration cards. Nearly 64% of the Iranian students pay yearly from 5,000 to 18,000 rubles to the landlord in addition to the rent to be registered. However, it happens that the landlords do not register their foreign tenants; for example, 3 Iranian students interviewed who have Russian housemates mentioned that the landlord refused to register them while their Russian housemates are registered by the landlord. On the other hand, 77% of the Tajik students have not faced any problem regarding the registration card and they barely pay for the registration card (85%). This is acceptable since most of them find their place of living by friends and family members, who have been through the same process.

However, problems with registration cards have led to two critical issues: 1. Landlords register international students (tenants) officially at “Russian Ministry of Internal Affairs”; however, many students checked by the police department notice that their registration card is not further active in the system or has been canceled by the landlord without their presence and in an advanced warning. And 2. The registration cards have become a kind of business in the black markets, where students and immigrants can buy forged registration cards that cost 2,000 rubles monthly, and it has absolutely no legal value.

### **Conclusion**

Negative feelings and uncertainties towards Immigrants and other ethnicities in Russia have pressured immigrants, especially international students. The public policies must target the discrimination reduction in the country to provide a more pleasant society for the people who left their home country for a better future. Immigrants must have equal access to the judicial organization in case of being discriminated against. Finding a place of living for international students who are primarily at young ages and for the first time entering a new foreign society is an essential and stressful task, which can either create a good or bad perception towards the contemporary society where they immigrated. In addition, and finally leads to either the integration and adaptation of immigrants in the host country or separation.

We can conclude that role of universities or private hostels in facilitating housing problems of international students is crucial. The more the students are placed in the hostels,

the easier it is to face issues such as the discrimination attitude of the landlords, registration cards, payments, etc. Moreover, the less the international students feel discriminated against, the more they can attract new students to study in the Russian Federation, which has a tremendous positive economic effect. One of the main problems found in this study is the language problem for Iranian students. The inability of students to talk Russian language and lack of knowledge about the culture and social atmosphere is believed to seriously affect discrimination. As misunderstandings increase, the feeling of being discriminated against increases. Moreover, the types of discrimination among Iranian and Tajik students in Moscow's rental market are almost similar. They have been refused to rent a living place because of their nationality, religion, and not being a citizen of the Russian federation. In addition, Iranian students have been refused to rent a place because they were international students, and they believed that the landlords talked with them with a bad language tone.

Moreover, the legal complexities and lack of information push students to black markets and put significant pressure on young students who have less life experience. For example, registration card has created confusion among international students. Although in modern life, controlling the population's movement can be achieved from papered documentation such as registration cards. Still, there are new methods of internal and external migration control. For example, mobile technology is one of the most accessible technologies for people to use for national identity registration. Mobile Identity registration leads to advantages for citizens, governments, and mobile operators. Arrangement of digital documentation mainly costs six times less than paper equivalents, as the main benefit, also better security, higher flexibility, better services, extended reach, and much other profit. At the same time, the Russian Federation mobile network infrastructure and operators are developed enough for the national identity registration program [22].

During the COVID-19 prevalence, the Russian Federation's government could control the movement of the society entirely. One mobile application that uses GPS is implemented to trace patients who tested positive for COVID-19. These patients choose treatment at home during quarantine to protect the community from spreading the virus [23]. The given information proves the accessibility of the Russian Federations to the technological infrastructures. They could control patients' location by smartphones. Of course, ethically, tracing people depend on the situation and can be reviewed in different aspects, which is not our subject to discuss. Still, it shows the ability and development of technology to make things easier and remove complications through society. Mobile identity registration is one of the samples that the Russian government can use to decrease confusion about the registration system. If the technology replaces humans, eliminating corruption can also reduce people's registration costs and government.

## References

1. Hajro, A. Acculturation, Coping, and Integration Success of International Skilled Migrants: An Integrative Review and Multilevel Framework / A. Hajro, G. K. Stahl, C. C. Clegg [et al.] *Human Resource Management Journal*. 2019. Vol. 29, No. 3. P. 328–352. DOI [10.1111/1748-8583.12233](https://doi.org/10.1111/1748-8583.12233).
2. Mui, A. C. Acculturation Stress and Depression among Asian Immigrant Elders / A. C. Mui, S. Y. Kang. *Social Work*. 2006. Vol. 51, No. 3. P. 243–255. DOI [10.1093/sw/51.3.243](https://doi.org/10.1093/sw/51.3.243).
3. Crockett, L. J. Acculturative stress, social support, and coping: Relations to psychological adjustment among Mexican American college students / L. J. Crockett, M. I. Iturbide, R. A. Torres Stone [et al.] *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*. 2007. Vol. 13, No. 4. P. 347–355. DOI [10.1037/1099-9809.13.4.347](https://doi.org/10.1037/1099-9809.13.4.347).
4. Suleman, S. Xenophobia as a Determinant of Health: An Integrative Review / S. Suleman, K. D. Garber, L. Rutkow. *Journal of Public Health Policy*. 2018. Vol. 39, No. 4. P. 407–423. DOI [10.1057/s41271-018-0140-1](https://doi.org/10.1057/s41271-018-0140-1).

5. Goldberg, H. J. The Affirmative Action Empire: Nations and Nationalism in the Soviet Union, 1923–1939. *History: Reviews of New Books* 2022. Vol. 30, No. 3. P. 120. DOI [10.1080/03612759.2002.10526154](https://doi.org/10.1080/03612759.2002.10526154).
6. Tafira, K. Is xenophobia racism? *Anthropology Southern Africa. Informa UK Limited*. 2011. Vol. 34, No. 3–4. P. 114–21. DOI [10.1080/23323256.2011.11500015](https://doi.org/10.1080/23323256.2011.11500015).
7. Chapman, H. S. Xenophobia on the Rise? Temporal and Regional Trends in Xenophobic Attitudes in Russia. / H. S. Chapman, K. L. Marquardt, Y. M. Herrera [et al.] *Comparative Politics* 2018. Vol. 50, No. 3. P. 381–394. DOI [10.5129/001041518822704944](https://doi.org/10.5129/001041518822704944).
8. Ilyushenko, V. I. Nacional-radikalizm v sovremennoj Rossii: ot nacionalizma k neonacizmu [National radicalism in modern Russia: from nationalism to nazism]. Ed. 2<sup>nd</sup>. Moscow : Academia, 2007. 317 p. (In Russ.).
9. Pipia, K. D. Ksenofobskie nastroyeniya v rossijskom obshchestvennom mnenii i puti ih predotvrashcheniya [Xenophobic sentiments in Russian public opinion and the ways of preventing them] : abstract of the dissertation ... cand. sci. sociol. : 22.00.04 / Pipia Karina Djanierovna ; FCTAS RAS. Moscow, 2017. 26 p. (In Russ.).
10. Brubaker, R. Myths and Misconceptions in the Study of Nationalism. National Self-Determination and Secession. In *National Self-Determination and Secession / Ed. M. Moore*. Oxford : Oxford Academic, 1998. P. 233–265. DOI [10.1093/0198293844.003.0011](https://doi.org/10.1093/0198293844.003.0011).
11. Shrader, H. Globalizacija, (de)civilizacija i moral' [Globalization, (de)civilization and morality]. *Zhurnal sociologii i social'noj antropologii [Journal of Sociology and Social Anthropology]*. 1998. Vol. 1, No. 2. P. 71–84. (In Russ.).
12. Stuken, T. Y. Diskriminatsiya v sotsial'notrudovykh otnosheniyakh. Ekonomicheskij aspekt [Discrimination in social and labor relations. The economic aspect]. 2007. Moscow : Inform-Znanie, 2007. 351 p. ISBN 5803-20-111-1. (In Russ.).
13. Veterinarov, V. Slavs Only: Ethnic Discrimination and Rental Prices / V. Veterinarov, V. Ivanov. *SSRN Electronic Journal* 2018. DOI [10.2139/ssrn.3249624](https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3249624).
14. Pager, D., Bayesian Bigot? Statistical Discrimination, Stereotypes, and Employer Decision Making / D. Pager, D. Karafin. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 2009. Vol. 621, No. 1. P. 70–93. DOI [10.1177/0002716208324628](https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716208324628).
15. Acolin, A. A Field Study of Rental Market Discrimination across Origins in France / A. Acolin, R. Bostic, G. Painter. *Journal of Urban Economics*. 2016. Vol. 95 P. 49–63. DOI [10.1016/j.jue.2016.07.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jue.2016.07.003).
16. Baldini, M. Ethnic discrimination in the Italian rental housing market. / M. Baldini, M. Federici *Journal of Housing Economics*. 2011. Vol. 20, No. 1. P. 1–14. DOI [10.1016/j.jhe.2011.02.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhe.2011.02.003).
17. Booth, A. Does Ethnic Discrimination Vary Across Minority Groups? Evidence from a Field Experiment / A. Booth, A. Leigh, E. Varganova. *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics* 2011. Vol. 74, No. 4. P. 547–573. DOI [10.1111/j.1468-0084.2011.00664.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0084.2011.00664.x).
18. Carlsson, M. Ethnic Discrimination in the London Market for Shared Housing / M. Carlsson, S. Eriksson. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*. 2014. Vol. 41, No. 8. P. 1276–1301. DOI [10.1080/1369183x.2014.965670](https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183x.2014.965670).
19. Bohren, J. A. *Inaccurate Statistical Discrimination: An Identification Problem* / J. A. Bohren, K. Haggag, A. Imas [et al.] PIER Working Paper No. 19-010, 2019. DOI [10.2139/ssrn.3406060](https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3406060).
20. Kubal, A. Spiral Effect of the Law: Migrants' Experiences of the State Law in Russia – A Comparative Perspective. *International Journal of Law in Context*. 2011. Vol. 12, No. 4. P. 453–468. DOI [10.1017/s1744552316000215](https://doi.org/10.1017/s1744552316000215).
21. Light, M. A. What Does It Mean to Control Migration? Soviet Mobility Policies in Comparative Perspective. *Law & Social Inquiry*. 2012. Vol. 37, No. 02. P. 395–429. DOI [10.1111/j.1747-4469.2012.01308.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-4469.2012.01308.x).
22. Van Do, T. Using Mobile Technology in National. / T. Van Do, C. Swafford, L. H. Khuong [et al.] *Identity Registration. Lecture Notes in Computer Science*. 2016. Vol. 9847. P. 163–172. DOI [10.1007/978-3-319-44215-0\\_13](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-44215-0_13).
23. Mbunge, E. Integrating Emerging Technologies into COVID-19 Contact Tracing: Opportunities, Challenges and Pitfalls. *Diabetes & Metabolic Syndrome: Clinical Research & Reviews* 2020. Vol. 14, No. 6. P. 1631–1636. DOI [10.1016/j.dsx.2020.08.029](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsx.2020.08.029).

**Bio notes:**

**Mehdi Afzali**, Candidate of Sociological Sciences, Leading Researcher, Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia.

**Contact information:** e-mail: [mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com](mailto:mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com); ORCID ID: [0000-0002-9577-5639](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9577-5639); RSCI Author ID: [985696](https://www.rsci.ru/author/985696); Web of Science Researcher ID: [AAA-5621-2019](https://www.webofscience.com/author/AAA-5621-2019); Scopus Author ID: [57212506339](https://www.scopus.com/author/57212506339).

**Zafar K. Vazirov**, Candidate of Economical Sciences, Leading Researcher, Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia.

**Contact information:** e-mail: [zafar.vazirov@mail.ru](mailto:zafar.vazirov@mail.ru); ORCID ID: [0000-0002-9318-6873](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9318-6873); RSCI Author ID: [943543](https://www.rsci.ru/author/943543); Web of Science Researcher ID: [S-7156-2018](https://www.webofscience.com/author/S-7156-2018); Scopus Author ID: [57194508693](https://www.scopus.com/author/57194508693).

**Natal'ya A. Bezverbnaya**, Candidate of Sociological Sciences, senior researcher, Institute for Demographic Research FCTAS RAS, Moscow, Russia.

**Contact information:** e-mail: [n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru](mailto:n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru); ORCID ID: [0000-0001-6617-8723](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6617-8723); RSCI Author ID: [926075](https://www.rsci.ru/author/926075); Web of Science Researcher ID: [AAT-5201-2020](https://www.webofscience.com/author/AAT-5201-2020); Scopus Author ID: [57218399144](https://www.scopus.com/author/57218399144).

Received on 09.01.2023; accepted for publication on 07.03.2023.  
The authors have read and approved the final manuscript.

## ДИСКРИМИНАЦИЯ МИГРАНТОВ НА МОСКОВСКОМ РЫНКЕ АРЕНДЫ ЖИЛЬЯ (НА ПРИМЕРЕ ИРАНСКИХ И ТАДЖИКСКИХ СТУДЕНТОВ)

**Афзали М.**

Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия  
E-mail: [mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com](mailto:mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com)

**Вазиров З. К.**

Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия  
E-mail: [zafar.vazirov@mail.ru](mailto:zafar.vazirov@mail.ru)

**Безвербная Н. А.**

Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия  
E-mail: [n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru](mailto:n.bezverbnaya@yandex.ru)

Для цитирования: Афзали, М. Дискриминация мигрантов на московском рынке аренды жилья (на примере иранских и таджикских студентов) / М. Афзали, З. К. Вазиров, Н. А. Безвербная // ДЕМИС. Демографические исследования. 2023. Т. 3, № 1. С. 69–82. DOI [10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5](https://doi.org/10.19181/demis.2023.3.1.5). EDN [BMXWQJ](https://www.edn.ru/entry/BMXWQJ).

**Аннотация.** При поиске жилья в г. Москве иностранные студенты сталкиваются как с многочисленными рекламными объявлениями, носящими дискриминационный характер, так и с арендодателями, отказывающими иммигрантам в аренде жилья из-за их этнической и религиозной принадлежности и т. д., что оказывает огромное давление на иностранных студентов. При этом арендодатели не считают, что требования, предъявляемые к кандидатам, носят дискриминационный характер. В статье представлены результаты исследования дискриминации на рынке аренды жилья в г. Москве по отношению к иранским и таджикским студентам. Выборка для интервью основана на следующих параметрах: опрашивались студенты, прибывшие из Ирана и Таджикистана и обучающиеся в ВУЗах г. Москвы, поскольку их объединяют схожий язык, вероисповедание и культура. В данном исследовании используется качественный подход, основанный на структурированном интервью, состоящим из 15 вопросов, чтобы понять проблемы, с которыми сталкиваются иранские и таджикские студенты на рынке аренды жилья в г. Москве. Кроме того, чтобы выяснить, содержат ли существующие объявления об аренде на российских сайтах и в приложениях по недвижимости слова и фразы, носящие дискриминационные настроения, мы проанализировали 1 221 объявление об аренде. Результаты анализа рекламы жилья показывают, что почти 25% рекламных объявлений на интернет-сайтах содержат дискриминационные выражения, такие как «Строго славянин», «Только славянин» и «Славянин (только граждане России)». Результаты исследования также показывают, что арендодатели отказывают в предоставлении квартиры, комнаты или койко-места иранским и таджикским студентам практически по одним и тем же причинам: этническая

принадлежность, вероисповедание, гражданство другой страны, а не Российской Федерации, статус студента. Можно сделать вывод о том, что роль университетов в решении жилищных проблем иностранных студентов и роль государства в обеспечении юридического доступа иммигрантов к рынку аренды жилья, особенно в условиях дискриминации, весьма незначительны.

**Ключевые слова:** дискриминация; ксенофобия; иностранные студенты; иммиграция; иммигранты; недвижимость; интервью; рынок жилья; Москва.

**Сведения об авторах:**

**Афзали Мехди**, кандидат социологических наук, ведущий научный сотрудник, Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия.

**Контактная информация:** e-mail: [mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com](mailto:mehdiafzali1991@gmail.com); ORCID ID: [0000-0002-9577-5639](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9577-5639); РИНЦ Author ID: [985696](https://elibrary.ru/985696); Web of Science Researcher ID: [AAA-5621-2019](https://orcid.org/AAA-5621-2019); Scopus Author ID: [57212506339](https://orcid.org/57212506339).

**Вазиров Зафар Кабутович**, кандидат экономических наук, ведущий научный сотрудник, Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия.

**Контактная информация:** e-mail: [zafarvazirov@mail.ru](mailto:zafarvazirov@mail.ru); ORCID ID: [0000-0002-9318-6873](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9318-6873); РИНЦ Author ID: [943543](https://elibrary.ru/943543); Web of Science Researcher ID: [S-7156-2018](https://orcid.org/S-7156-2018); Scopus Author ID: [57194508693](https://orcid.org/57194508693).

**Безвербная Наталья Александровна**, кандидат социологических наук, старший научный сотрудник, Институт демографических исследований ФНИСЦ РАН, Москва, Россия.

**Контактная информация:** e-mail: [n.bezverbnyaya@yandex.ru](mailto:n.bezverbnyaya@yandex.ru); ORCID ID: [0000-0001-6617-8723](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6617-8723); РИНЦ Author ID: [926075](https://elibrary.ru/926075); Web of Science Researcher ID: [AAT-5201-2020](https://orcid.org/AAT-5201-2020); Scopus Author ID: [57218399144](https://orcid.org/57218399144).

Статья поступила в редакцию 09.01.2023; принята в печать 07.03.2023.

Авторы прочитали и одобрили окончательный вариант рукописи.